



# St. Paul Planting Project 2023 Validation Report

**Document Prepared by City Forest Credits**

**August 13, 2024**

## PROJECT OVERVIEW

<i>Project Name</i>	St. Paul Planting Project 2023
<i>Project Registry Number</i>	058
<i>Project Type</i>	Afforestation/Reforestation
<i>City Forest Credits Protocol Version</i>	Version 11, February 24, 2023
<i>Project Start Date</i>	November 16, 2024
<i>Project Location</i>	City of St. Paul, Minnesota
<i>Project Operator</i>	Green Cities Accord

## SUMMARY

*State what stage of crediting this Validation Report applies to (i.e. after planting, Year 4, 6, 14, or 26). Provide a few sentences about the overall project. Include the Planting Design and Quantification Method.*

The City of St. Paul partnered with Green Cities Accord to establish an urban tree planting carbon project that registered trees planted from 2021-2023. The project includes 11,288 trees planted within the city limits of St. Paul, Minnesota from November 24, 2020, through November 16, 2023. The trees were planted in public right-of-way along city streets as well as on other park land where St. Paul has the authority to plant and maintain trees. Green Cities Accord serves as the Project Operator, the entity who undertakes a project, registers the carbon credits, and is ultimately responsible for submitting annual monitoring reports as well as any project documentation necessary throughout the duration of the project.

The Project used the single-tree planting design and quantification method.

## ELIGIBILITY

### **Project Operator Identity (Section 1.1)**

#### *Criteria*

A Project requires at least one Project Operator (“PO”), an entity organized and licensed under the laws of its jurisdiction, or a governmental body, which undertakes a Project, registers it with the registry of City Forest Credits (the “Registry”), and is ultimately responsible for all aspects of the project and its reporting.

#### *Issue Validated*

Green Cities Accord provided its W9, Articles of Incorporation Amendment Name Change, and Bylaws as documentation to City Forest Credits.

### **Project Submittal Dates (Section 2)**

*Criteria*

Project must submit applications to the Registry within six months of the date of the planting of the last tree that is part of the planting project. Project with plantings prior to May 1, 2017 are not eligible.

*Issue Validated*

Project Operator submitted the application on January 3, 2024 which is less than six months from the date of planting the last tree on November 16, 2023.

**Permanence – Project Duration and Reversals (Section 1.3, 2, 8)**

**A. Project Duration – Project Implementation Agreement (Section 1.3 and 2)**

*Criteria*

Project Operator must sign a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry setting forth the Project Operator’s obligation to comply with the protocol. Project Operator must monitor and report for 26 years.

*Issue Validated*

Green Cities Accord and City Forest Credits signed a Project Implementation Agreement on May 11, 2024 for the St. Paul Planting Project 2023 (Project Registry Number 058). The project has a 26-year duration under City Forest Credits Afforestation and Reforestation Protocol Version 11.

**B. Reversals (Section 8)**

*Criteria*

A “Reversal” is loss of stored carbon such that the remaining stored carbon within the Project Area is less than the amount of stored carbon for which Registry credits have been issued. The Registry will retain in a Reversal Pool account 5% of all credits issued to planting projects. This Reversal Pool account shall be used to compensate for Unavoidable Reversals.

*Issue Validated*

The Project Design Document and request for credits based on GHG mitigation includes a 5% deduction for the Reversal Pool account of credits. 1,566 were contributed from this Project to the Registry Reversal Pool. The carbon quantification and Reversal Pool deduction were verified by the Validation and Verification Body, Matthew Lee.

**Project Location (Section 1.4)**

*Criteria*

Project Area must be located in parcels within or along the boundary of at least one of the urban area criteria. The Project Operator must specify the Project Area and provide an electronic map of the Project area.

*Issue Validated*

The Project is located in the City of St. Paul, Minnesota, which meets protocol criteria Section 1.4. The Project Operator has provided maps as supporting evidence, including regional-scale and project area maps.

### **Project Area (Section 1.5)**

#### *Criteria*

The Project Operator may include more than one planting site in a project. The initial planting of trees for all properties in a project must occur within a 36-month period or less.

#### *Issue Validated*

The Project includes 11,288 planting sites over a 3-year period. The trees were planted between November 24, 2020 and November 16, 2023.

### **Ownership or Eligibility to Receive Potential Credits (Section 1.7)**

#### *Criteria*

Project Operator must demonstrate ownership of potential credits or eligibility to receive potential credits.

#### *Issue Validated*

The City of St. Paul is the landowner for the St. Paul Planting Project 2023. The City has granted the Project Operator the right to receive potential credits, meeting protocol criteria Section 1.7. The Project Operator provided an Agreement to Collaborate, signed by the City and the Project Operator on May 10, 2024, as supporting documentation.

### **Additionality (Section 4)**

#### *Criteria*

The City Forest Credits Standard and Afforestation and Reforestation Protocol ensure additionality for every carbon project. A project activity is additional if it can be demonstrated that the activity results in emission reductions or removals that are in excess of what would be achieved under a “business as usual” scenario and the activity would not have occurred in the absence of the incentive period provided by the carbon markets.

Projects must demonstrate the following:

- A Legal Requirements Test that declares city trees planted due to an enacted law or ordinance not eligible (Section 1.8);
- Either 1) a project-specific baseline or 2) the current version of the Registry’s performance standard baseline developed in adherence with the WRI GHG Protocol (CFC Standard);
- Project Operators must sign and comply with a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry that requires a 26-year Project Duration.

#### *Issue Validated*

Project Operator has met the Legal Requirements Test that the trees were not planted due to an enacted ordinance or law. Project Operator used the Registry’s performance standard baseline in adherence with the WRI GHG Protocol, which is attached to the Project Design Document. Project Operator signed a Project Implementation Agreement with the Registry for a 26-year Project Duration.

Project Operator has signed an Attestation of Additionality that confirms the above, as well as stating that the 26-year Project Duration is in addition to and longer than any commitment the Project Operator makes to non-carbon project tree plantings and that trees were not planted on sites that were forested and then cleared of trees within the prior 10 years. The Attestation of Additionality was signed by Green Cities Accord on May 14, 2024.

### **No Double Counting and No Net Harm (Section 5)**

#### *Criteria*

The City Forest Credits Standard describes prevention of double-counting in Section 5.1 and safeguards and the “No Net Harm” Principle in Section 5.2.

Project activities shall not cause net harm to the environment or urban communities. Project Operator must sign an Attestation of No Double Counting of Credits and No Net Harm. Per Section 5.2 of the Afforestation and Reforestation Protocol, the Project Operator must submit documentation showing no overlap of Project Trees with any other registered urban forest afforestation and reforestation project. As part of Validation, the Registry shall use the appropriate geospatial tool to independently investigate whether there is any overlap between the Project Trees and other registered urban forest carbon projects.

#### *Issue Validated*

Project Operator has submitted a signed Attestation of No Double Counting of Credits and No Net Harm, and the Registry sees no evidence of net harm from this project. The Registry has analyzed geospatial data of the Project Area against that of all other registered urban forest carbon afforestation and reforestation projects to confirm that the Project Area for this project has not already received credits under the CFC Standard. The Attestation of No Double Counting of Credits and No Net Harm was signed by Green Cities Accord on May 13, 2024.

### **Carbon Quantification (Section 10 and Appendix A)**

#### *Criteria*

Project Operator must follow the quantification methods outlined in Appendix A of the Protocol.

#### *Issue Validated*

Project Operator used the single-tree planting design and quantification method , per Protocol criteria in Appendix A. Project Operator signed the Attestation of Planting, including attachments of invoices of trees purchased and planting photos. Project Operator provided an Attestation of Planting Affirmation signed by the City of St. Paul.

The Carbon Quantification Summary is as follows:

Total number of trees planted	11,288
Project area (acres), if applicable	N/A
Total number of trees per acre, if applicable	N/A
Credits attributed to the project (tCO <sub>2</sub> e)	39,152
Credits after mortality deduction (default is 20%)	29,755
Contribution to Registry Reversal Pool Account (5%) (tCO <sub>2</sub> e)	1,566
<b>Total credits to be issued to the Project Operator (tCO<sub>2</sub>e)</b>	<b>29,755</b>
<b>Total credits requested to be issued in Year 1 (10% of above)</b>	<b>2,976</b>

GHG Assertion: Project Operator asserts that the Project results in GHG emissions mitigation of 29,755 tons CO<sub>2</sub>e. Per Protocol guidelines, 10% of the Project GHG emissions mitigation is issued after initial tree planting, or 2,976 tons CO<sub>2</sub>e.

### Co-Benefits Quantification (Section 10 and Appendix A)

#### Criteria

Project Operator must follow the co-benefit quantification methods for rainfall interception, air quality, and energy savings.

#### Issue Validated

Project Operator has followed the co-benefits quantification method using the templates provided by City Forest Credits. The following table documents the quantified ecosystem services in resource units and avoided costs per year when Project Trees reach 25 years old.

<i>Ecosystem Services</i>	<i>Resource Units</i>	<i>Value</i>
Rainfall Interception (m <sup>3</sup> /yr)	75,615	\$541,331
Air Quality (t/yr)	2.2851	\$10,443
Energy: Cooling – Electricity (kWh/yr)	2,205,871	\$167,426
Energy: Heating – Natural Gas (kBtu/yr)	31,359,410	\$305,275
<b>Grand Total (\$/yr)</b>		<b>\$1,024,475</b>

### Monitoring and Reporting (Section 7)

#### Criteria

Project Operator must report on tree conditions across the Project Area for the Project Duration. Reports must be submitted annually on the anniversary of the date of the first Verification Report. At Years 4, 6, 14, and 26, sampling, measurement of trees or canopy coverage, and/or quantification of CO<sub>2</sub>e will be submitted for request of credit issuance in lieu of a monitoring report that year.

#### Issue Validated

Project Operator has agreed to submit written annual monitoring reports using the template provided by City Forest Credits. Monitoring plans have been described in the Project Design Document. Green Cities Accord will work in coordination with the City of St. Paul to submit monitoring reports. The City of St. Paul inspects and records significant tree or canopy loss annually. This data, and any eligibility status will be requested by Green Cities Accord for monitoring reports.

### **Social Impacts (Section 11)**

#### *Criteria*

Project Operator shall use the Carbon Project Social Impact template to evaluate the SDGs to determine how a Project provides social impacts that contribute towards achievement of the global goals, as described in Section 11.

#### *Issue Validated*

Project Operator has submitted a completed Carbon Project Social Impact document. The project meets protocol criteria Section 11.

## **VERIFICATION REPORT**

CFC reviewed the Verification Report August 13, 2024, by Matthew Lee to ensure it accurately reflects the documentation contained in the Project Design Document and supporting documents.

## VALIDATION CONCLUSION

I attest that all the information provided in this validation report is free of material misstatement, to the best of my knowledge. The project complies with the validation criteria outlined in the City Forest Credits Standard and Afforestation and Reforestation Protocol Version 11.

Approved by City Forest Credits on August 13, 2024, in 2024.